The Renaissance Of Green Marketing Innovation Of Villages Sustainable Tourism
TB. Dicky Faldy Syahid Noor1, Tirta Mursitama2, Sri Bramantoro Abdinagoro3, Destha Titi Raharjana4, Naima Andleeb5

1,2,3Management Department, Binas Business School Doctor of Research in Management, Binus Nusantara University, Jakarta, Indonesia 11480,
4Gadjah Mada University, Yogyakarta Indonesia 55281
School of Accountancy and Finance, The University of Lahore.

ABSTRACT

Green tourism for tourist villages is currently in great demand by tourists, and this has been the case since the COVID-19 pandemic when tourists want something to do with the outdoors. However, this phenomenon makes tourist village managers have to be extra focused on maintaining the environment, and one indication of sustainable tourist villages is implementing green marketing innovation as a form of responsible tourism. This research was created using Vos Viewer and Biblioshiny with data from Scopus as a tool to find the latest gaps in tourist villages that innovate in a green and sustainable manner; therefore, this research is a renaissance of the combination of previous research and will become a research concept in the future.

Keywords: Green Marketing Innovation, Village Tourism, Rural Tourism, Bibliometric Analysis

1 Introduction

Global sustainability has increased corporate awareness of the impact of changes that can be detrimental to business activities and changes to the natural environment (Päätäri et al., 2016; Yue et al., 2020). As a result, environmentally friendly marketing is increasingly popular, especially in company strategies to maintain their current competitive advantage (Majeed & Gon Kim, 2023; K. et al. et al., 2019).

The business plan developed by the company was quickly adopted and adapted to the environmental management system, waste reduction, and handling of environmental issues such as voluntary and mandatory environmental programs and green paper business innovation al. (Li et al., 2020)

Green marketing is a product marketing concept that focuses on the environment. It includes various activities, including product modifications, manufacturing process modifications, sustainable packaging, and advertising modifications. However, defining green marketing is challenging because of many intertwined and contradictory meanings. One example is the difference in social, environmental, and commercial definitions associated with the term. Other similar terms used are environmental marketing and green marketing.

Creativity is a proxy for environmental innovation that contributes to the greening of organizations by creating more environmentally friendly services, solving environmental problems, and mitigating the organization's environmental impact (Paillé & Raineri, 2015; Song and Yu, 2018).

Eco-friendly creative behavior of tourism employees contributes towards environmentally friendly sustainability not only of their tour companies but also of tourist destinations due to the influence of creative environmentally friendly solutions in environmentally friendly tour packages on tourists and the larger community (Luu, 2019; Mittal & Dhar, 2016). Therefore, organizations need to integrate the philosophy of sustainability with a creativity mindset in the environmental era to produce environmentally friendly initiatives and activate environmentally friendly creativity (Y. C. C. Chang, 2013; S. Chen et al., 2023). Since the 1990s, green/environmental marketing has been prevalent in many consumer goods sectors, including apparel, technology, services, and travel (Karolos Papadas, 2021). Media efforts and strategies are focused on creating this change towards the consumption of environmentally friendly products, called environmentally friendly advertising (Dahhan & Arenkov, 2021).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Authors (Year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ecological marketing is concerned with all marketing activities that have served to help cause environmental problems and may provide a remedy for environmental problems.</td>
<td>(Henion &amp; Kinnear 1976)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green marketing means minimizing a product's environmental impact through product redesign, sustainable manufacturing, and integrated marketing campaigns. It aims to promote eco-friendly products and meet the demand for sustainable consumption.</td>
<td>(Polonsky and Everitt 1990)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Environmental marketing is the holistic management process responsible for identifying, anticipating, and satisfying the requirements of customers and society profitably and sustainably. (Peattie, 2004)

Green marketing involves strategic, tactical, and internal processes and activities that aim to create, communicate, and deliver products and/or services with minimal environmental impact. (K. Papadas & Avlonitis, 2017)

Green marketing and environmental marketing have developed corporate strategies to achieve performance growth. (Nuryakin & Maryati, 2022)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Authors (Year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental marketing</td>
<td>(Journeault et al., 2016; Kesey, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological marketing</td>
<td>(Lockrey, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmentally friendly marketing</td>
<td>(H. Chen et al., 2018; Tsai et al., 2020; Zubair et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable marketing</td>
<td>(Jung et al., 2021; Osburg &amp; Ludorf, 2016; Peterson, 2020; Van Dam, 2017)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. The evolution of the green marketing concept

Developing countries' rural areas experience identical waste management problems as urban areas. However, rural waste services need to be addressed by local governments. The average waste service in rural Indonesia is 4.65%, even though more than 80% of Indonesia is rural (Indonesia Statistic 2020; Worldometers, 2021). The management of poor waste can result in poor environmental sustainability (David et al., 2019). It can endanger the environment and human health, decreasing productivity and economic growth in society (Kubanza et al., 2017). Sustainable tourism villages or green tourism villages, where they must pay attention to their village or their environment remaining green to become a truly sustainable tourism village.

This study might be the first analysis to investigate green marketing innovation and village's sustainable tourism topic with bibliometric analysis. The Biblioshiny and Vos Viewer are software used to address the following research question: What is the coverage of the literature study on automated green marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism? What is the most significant contribution to the green marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism topic? The authors believe that the subject of green marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism and its adoption is novel, and this research can serve as a helpful starting point for future research on this topic.

2 Related Studies and Background

Environmentalism has become an essential social and business issue in the 21st century. Consumers are increasingly environmentally conscious and demand environmentally friendly products from manufacturers. It has led to new concepts like green marketing and consumerism (Nath et al., 2013). In several documents, there are several discussions related to green marketing and sustainability, such as:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Authors (Year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental marketing</td>
<td>(Journeault et al., 2016; Kesey, 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological marketing</td>
<td>(Lockrey, 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmentally friendly marketing</td>
<td>(H. Chen et al., 2018; Tsai et al., 2020; Zubair et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable marketing</td>
<td>(Jung et al., 2021; Osburg &amp; Ludorf, 2016; Peterson, 2020; Van Dam, 2017)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. The Literature review of the green marketing concept

The concept of green marketing was introduced by Hennion and Kinnear in 1976 in the book Ecology Marketing as “all marketing activities aimed at helping overcome problems that exist in the environment.” Then, in 1987, an environmental commission called the World Commission on Environment and Development, commonly known as the Bruntland Report, established an understanding of sustainability. The Brundtland Commission stated 1987 that “sustainable development is necessary without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs. » Although at that time, there were still no specific rules or guidelines governing the meaning of sustainability. Alternatively, at least the idea is that companies can reduce their environmental impact during procurement, production, packaging, and/or disposal sustainably. The impacts are varied, from carbon emissions to packaging materials and food bags that are not naturally biodegradable. (Dangelico & Vocalelli, 2017) Investigated the development of environmentally friendly marketing and found that over several decades, there has been a change in the definition of environmentally friendly marketing. Influencing by the growing issue of environmental sustainability that appears in international policy discussions. Factors that are widely discussed and are very useful for businesses that want to design, develop, and market environmentally friendly products include:

Understanding the characteristics of environmentally friendly products, identifying factors that influence the price of environmentally friendly products, consumers’ willingness to pay more for environmentally friendly products, and customer sales channels for environmentally friendly products as well as advertising tools in the form of 4 Green Marketing.
Explains the activities of companies that are forced to look for new ways to achieve their goals by applying the concept of socially responsible behavior with a focus on implementing environmentally friendly marketing. Green marketing strategies can be defined based on the revised green marketing matrix of nine quadrants. The nine quadrants include recommended strategies based on the penetration of the company's environmental focus and objectives as well as its marketing approach. Revised environmentally friendly marketing strategy matrix Figure 3 revised environmentally friendly marketing strategy matrix (Majerova, 2015) tries to classify the meaning of green marketing, which was researched based on literature from 1990 to 2014.

The research results explain a classification of articles about green marketing based on period, period, and topic, including ecological orientation, friendly marketing strategies, environment, green marketing functions, and consequences of green marketing. Wymer and Polonsky (2015) argue that some researchers believe that continuous improvement will result in sustainable production, which results in higher profits. Manufacturers typically avoid more waste and increased inputs because they reduce costs and revenues. Green marketing comes from an organization's concern for the environment. The origin of this concept comes from organizations realizing that their existence and survival lie in the interaction between their interests and the interests of consumers and society. Environmentally friendly marketing includes various activities such as product modification, production process changes, advertising modifications, and packaging changes (Mahmoud, 2018).

![Fig. 1 (Majerova, 2015) Green Marketing Modification Matrix](image1)

![Fig 2 Green Marketing Literature in three journal sources (Kumar, 2016)](image2)

Figure 3 above is a study (Kumar, 2016) regarding the classification of peer-reviewed articles from three areas of business management that form green marketing, including sustainability, marketing, and operations management. Sources for reviewing green marketing literature include Emerald, Taylor and Francis, MDPI, and Elsevier Science Journal.
Figure 3 above summarizes an overview of mining marketing taxonomy based on subject libraries over approximately 25 years. Categories of articles related to environmentally friendly marketing include green marketing functions, green marketing strategies, ecological orientation, and consequences of green marketing. Future developments towards green marketing must be distinct from business activities. Hotels implementing corporate social responsibility (CSR) exemplify green marketing applied to tourism. The research results help develop the business in the future—a practical understanding of using environmentally friendly marketing messages to persuade and attract consumers. Therefore, the green concept regarding consumer understanding is positive and can encourage consumer service purchasing behavior (C. H. Chang, 2019). (K. Papadas & Avlonitis, 2017) argues that environmentally friendly marketing will become essential for sustainable business strategies. Organizations that apply green marketing principles in their business processes will perform better than companies that do not implement green marketing. This research presents a green marketing-oriented structure consisting of three dimensions: green marketing orientation, strategic green marketing orientation, and internal marketing orientation. At the time of implementation, according to Toal (Khan et al., 2020; Li et al., 2020), Suppose a relatively small company has environmentally oriented desires. In that case, it will achieve the desired results using an environmentally friendly marketing strategy. However, if it does not use an environmentally friendly strategy, it will not achieve—expected results.

3 Data Collection & Methodology

Data Collection

Scopus is widely regarded as one of the most distinguished multidisciplinary abstracts and citation databases. The access to peer-reviewed academic publications, articles, book chapters, and conference papers, including books, is made by Scopus. They provide the metadata, and publishers include the names of the authors, their affiliation, the year the document was published, the electronic identity (EID) of the paper, the title of the source, the volume/issue/pages, the number of citations, the source, the document category, and identifier for the digital object (DOI).

Scopus contains over 84 million data records from over 7,000 publishers in 27,000 journals. According to Elsevier’s data fast-fact website, the company’s articles account for approximately 18% of global research and 28% of citation share. Additionally, (Baas et al., 2020; Rejeb et al., 2023) concluded, based on the preceding information, that the Scopus database is an excellent and reliable source for bibliometric analysis. Thus, the authors of this paper conducted their bibliometric research using the Scopus database.

Scopus is widely used and considered one of the most prominent multidisciplinary media as a citation database and means for publishing reputable journals. Access in Scopus consists of academic publications, articles, book chapters, and conference papers, including books created by Scopus. Scopus facilities such as providing metadata, publishers include the name of the Author, their affiliation, year of Publication of the document, electronic identity (EID) of the paper, source title, volume/edition/page, number of citations, source, document category, and identifier for the digital object (DOI). Scopus has access to approximately 18% of global research and 28% of citations and contains more than 84 million data records from more than 7,000 publishers in 27,000 journals (Baas et al., 2020; Rejeb et al., 2023) based on the previous information, that the Scopus database is an excellent and reliable source.
for bibliometric analysis. Therefore, the Author of this paper conducted his bibliometric research using the Scopus database.

Research data on green marketing innovation village and rural tourism was taken on September 8, 2023. Then, the researchers summarized it in a bibliometric analysis paper using the Scopus data search method using the keywords "GREEN INNOVATION, AND GREEN MARKETING INNOVATION AND VILLAGES TOURISM AND RURAL TOURISM", to collect credible data. These keywords were chosen to find research discussing green marketing innovation in tourist villages. Therefore, these keywords will specifically produce relevant research output. Then, various article titles, abstracts, and keywords are published in the Scopus database. Various files such as articles, book chapters, novels, conference papers, book reviews, and books were found in this research. The researcher only filtered publications that used English in this research. So, the overall search results, Scopus search, resulted in 1,526 files.

**Methodology**

This research discusses papers using three separate econometric literature analysis techniques: performance analysis, scientific mapping, and network analysis (Donthu et al., 2021; Noyons et al., 1999; Zehra & Urooj, 2022). This research uses performance perspective analysis by examining many publications and highly relevant citations to determine how many authors, journals, and several countries have made significant contributions to research discussing the topic of green marketing innovation in tourist villages. This method shows which journals, authors, and articles are most cited or valuable. Furthermore, scientific mapping techniques allow researchers to show how research mapping on specific topics is related or related. It explains that publications with an underlying theme will be the relationship between topics with various types of analysis, such as quotation and co-citation analysis, collocation analysis, and co-authorship analysis. Finally, the last technique is network analysis, where clustering and network metrics show different results.

**4 Result of Bibliometric Analysis**

A search using GREEN MARKETING INNOVATION AND VILLAGES TOURISM AND RURAL TOURISM produces 1,526 documents. And then, it shows that academics are interested in green marketing innovation in the tourism sector. Table 1 shows that articles are 64.7%, books are 19.5%, reviews are 7.5%, book chapters are 5.2%, and conference papers are 2.8%. Meanwhile, editorials are 0.3%, and notes are only 0.1%, less than articles and books. Thus, this shows that the subject is relatively rare and new.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article</td>
<td>1471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Book</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Book Chapter</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Paper</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Scopus, Biblioshiny

Documents retrieved from Scopus were filtered into documents published in 2016 and beyond. There are 90 documents with the dominating countries, namely the United Kingdom with 19 documents, the United States with 17 documents, Australia with 10 documents, and China with 8 documents. Furthermore, a total of 37 studies, the most numerous are entitled Mastering Sustainable Tourism and Rural Tourism in the Global Economy, Encouraging Corporate Social Responsibility and Sustainable Tourism Development in Global Tourism from Kasemsap, K., published in 2017 which discusses village tourism in the era of globalization and sustainable tourism in the global era. In 2018, there were 112 documents with a researcher named Lujun Su, who researched signal theory. This research investigated how the perception of a destination's reputation impacts environmentally responsible behavior (ERB) and subjective well-being (SWB) of tourists through satisfaction and identification with a destination.

The topic of green marketing innovation increases yearly; in 2018, there were 112 documents. In 2019, there were 141 documents. In 2020, there were 213 documents. In 2021, there were 338 documents; in 2022, there were 524 documents.
3.1 Source Publication and Analysis

3.1.1 Publication Focus Areas

The subject matter of green marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism are extensive and diverse (Table 4). The publications 25.7% are in the field of Social Science, followed by Environmental Science 16.9%, Business, Management and Accounting 12%, Engineering 7.3%, Energy 7.1%, Computer Science 6.1% and Economics, Econometrics and Finance 6.0%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SUBJECT AREA</th>
<th>Number of Results</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>840</td>
<td>25.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Science</td>
<td>552</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business, Management and Accounting</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics, Econometrics and Finance</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts and Humanities</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural and Biological Sciences</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earth and Planetary Sciences</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision Sciences</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multidisciplinary</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biochemistry, Genetics and Molecular Biology</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials Science</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics and Astronomy</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuroscience</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Engineering</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Professions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig 4: The Yearly number of scientific studies on green innovation village tourism and rural tourism
Source: Scopus and created by Excel

Table 4: The Publication’s subject matter areas
3.1.2. Most Publication Source Based Country

Figure 5 shows the number of citations by countries of paper about green marketing innovation and villages and rural tourism, based on publication country. Number one is China, with 148 citations (23%), followed by the United States of America with 122 (19%), the United Kingdom with 104 citations (16%), Indonesia with 53 citations (8%), and Australia 49 citation (8%).

Fig 5: Most cited documents according to publication country
Source: Scopus, elaborated in Excel

Fig 6: Most cited publication source. Source: Scopus, created in Excel
3.2 Document Analysis

3.2.1 Publication with most citations

Figure 7 shows the number of citations received by authors Wang Y et al. (2019, 2020, 2021, 2022) have 406 citations with Scopus. In terms of specific explanations, their studies on environmentally friendly marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism have yet to be conducted much research and only focus on renewable and sustainable energy review.

![Fig 7. Citation of documents. Source: Scopus, elaborated in VOS viewer](image)

3.2.2 Most Used Popular Keyword

The words most frequently used by journal authors are presented in Figure 10. The term "China" is the most frequently used, with a frequency of 375 (12%), followed by the term "sustainable development" with a frequency of 259 (8%), then the term sustainability with a frequency of 141 (4%), then the term "tourism" with a frequency of 123 (4%), the term "rural area" frequency 107 (3%), the term "tourism development" frequency 103 (3%), the term economic development frequency 101 (3%), the term human frequency is 93 (3%) and the term rural development has a frequency of 107 (3%). Thus, research on green marketing innovation in the village and rural tourism still needs to be researched.

![Fig 8: Highest-frequency keyword combinations used by authors](image)

Source: Scopus, created by Biblioshiny

Figure 9 displays the VOSviewer map of author keyword occurrence weights with 3 clusters. The keywords most frequently used by authors in cluster 1 are "model," "characteristic," and "China." The terms "effect, transformation," and "performance" dominate Cluster 2, and Cluster 3 includes "rural revitalization," "rural revitalization strategy," "digital village," and "rural space" from 2016-2022.
3.2.3 Most Trending Topics Regarding Green Innovation in Villages Tourism

Using Biblioshiny, we can see trending topics related to green marketing innovation in village and rural tourism. In 2019-2020, the trending topics were “history” and “geography.” Between 2020 and 2022, the trending topics shifted to “destination image” and “digital village.” Figure 12 shows how often the ten most frequently used keywords are related. The phrases green marketing innovation, villages tourism, and rural tourism are essential themes to investigate.

Source: Scopus
3.3 Author Analysis

3.3.1 The Most Productive Authors

Figure 10 depicts the results of bibliometric analysis of authors who have published articles on robo-advisors and their applications. Wang Y; Wang C, Li X, Zhang Y; Liu Y, and Wang X. Wang Y is the most prolific writer. They are the most cited authors of the paper entitled Environmental Regulation and Environmental Productivity: The Case of China, with 305 citations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors Name</th>
<th>Number of Document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wang Y</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wang C</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li X</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zhang Y</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liu Y</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 11: Word growth
Source: Scopus, created in Biblioshiny

Fig. 12: Thematic map
Source: Scopus, analysis in Biblioshiny
Researchers conducted a bibliographic analysis of 2474 documents identified by Scopus regarding green marketing innovation, village tourism, and rural tourism. These topics were published between 2016 and December 2022 based on the analysis results. The main conclusion from this analysis is that the topics presented are relatively new and have significant growth potential. These observations and some additional findings are discussed in this section.

To begin with, in 2016, research on Greenways for Rural Sustainable Development: An Integration between Geographic Information Systems and Group Analytic Hierarchy Process (Ottomano Palmisano et al., 2016) was one of the studies on sustainable tourist villages by applying environmental concepts.

5 Discussion & Conclusion

Wang X 19
Li J 15
Na Na 14
Hall CM 13
Li Y 13

Fig. 13 Paper production by Author
Source: Scopus created in Biblioshiny

Fig. 14: Most relevant authors
Source: Scopus, created in Biblioshiny
In 2017, (Wigboldus et al.) began research with the title Scaling Green Rubber Cultivation in Southwest China: An Integrative Analysis of Stakeholder Perspectives, which focuses on providing knowledge about the green environment in rubber production to company stakeholders. Then, in 2018, research from (Chin et al.) which had started on green marketing of tourist villages that focused on environmentally friendly marketing, received less attention in the context of rural destinations. It is the first study conducted to understand the relationship between environmentally friendly marketing tools (eco-brand, eco-label, and environmental advertising) and environmentally friendly purchasing behavior in rural tourist destinations from tourists’ perceptions with the title “The Implementation of Green Marketing Tools in Rural Tourism: The Readiness of Tourists?”. In 2019 (Sheng) released a book titled Guanshi and Local Green Development in China: The Role of Entrepreneurs and Local Leaders with Innovation. The book reviews the role of actors based on three case studies that implement environmentally friendly development at the local level, namely Shanghai Pudong New Area, Baoding, and Wuining. This book shows how local officials and entrepreneurs can also become champions of a greener environment at the local level in China.

In 2020 (Sulistiyani et al.) with the title Bureaucratic Role in Green Village Innovation Model at Yogyakarta, Indonesia, researched tourist villages in Yogya from the perspective of human resources in the bureaucracy and recommendations for improving the green village innovation bureaucratic model will be explained in this journal. The role of the bureaucracy in implementing the program experienced errors at the management level, such as technical-operational errors, with a focus on innovation in implementing green villages. Then, in 2021 (Lavuri et al.) conducted research on Green Sustainability: Fostering Factors and Behavioral Differences Between Millennials and Gen Z: Mediating Role of Green Purchase Intention is about researching the factors that drive green purchase intentions and understanding the differences between two generations, such as millennials and Generation Z, in green purchasing behavior. Data was collected from 372 respondents from two generations from three states of southern India using purchase intention and TPB theory, the theory of plan behavior. In 2022 (Zhao et al.) National rural greening and beautification modes in different climatic zones of China based on multivariate statistics of typical villages with research analyzing and explaining the characteristics of greening modes and rural beauty to provide ideas for building beautiful and livable rural environments while realizing the goals of rural revitalization and development.

6 Limitation & Future Research

This research is limited to only applying green marketing innovations in the tourism village sector. However, this can be a reference for mapping and helping provide references for improving the concept of developing sustainable tourism villages through green marketing innovations in the future. Then, future research can use other objects besides more comprehensive tourist villages, such as green marketing innovations in hotels, manufacturing companies, and restaurants.

Reference

10. Indonesia, B.-S. (2020). Statistik Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia 2020. BPS-Statistic Indonesia,


